

IN THE  
COURT OF APPEALS OF MARYLAND

---

September Term, 2013

---

No. 52

---

MOTOR VEHICLE ADMINISTRATION,

*Petitioner,*

v.

APRIL MARIE DEERING,

*Respondent.*

---

On Appeal from the Circuit Court for Somerset County

(D. William Simpson, Judge)

Pursuant to a writ of Certiorari to the Circuit Court for Somerset County

---

**BRIEF OF**

**THE NATIONAL COLLEGE FOR DUI DEFENSE**

**AND**

**THE MARYLAND CRIMINAL DEFENSE ATTORNEYS' ASSOCIATION**

**AS AMICI CURIAE**

LEONARD R. STAMM  
GOLDSTEIN & STAMM, P.A.  
6301 Ivy Lane, Suite 504  
Greenbelt, Maryland 20770  
stamm.lenny@gmail.com  
(301) 345-0122

**Counsel on Behalf of  
The NCCD and The MCDAA**

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
STATEMENT OF THE CASE.....	1
STATEMENT OF FACTS.....	2
SUMMARY OF ARGUMENT.....	2
ARGUMENT.....	4
I.    THE CONSIDERATIONS GOVERNING THE CHOICE OF SUBMITTING TO OR REFUSING AN ALCOHOL TEST ARE MUCH MORE COMPLEX NOW THAN WHEN <i>SITES</i> WAS DECIDED IN 1984, THE CONSEQUENCES OF A WRONG CHOICE MORE SEVERE, AND THE NEED FOR COUNSEL GREATER.....	4
II.   THE DUE PROCESS RIGHT TO CONTACT COUNSEL WAS RECOGNIZED BY THIS COURT IN <i>SITES</i> PRIMARILY DUE TO A POTENTIAL LOSS OF THE ABILITY TO EARN A LIVELIHOOD, AND THE MVA HEARING IS THE ONLY FORUM WHERE LOSS OF EMPLOYMENT OR INABILITY TO OBTAIN EMPLOYMENT CAN MEANINGFULLY BE ADDRESSED. ....	10
III.  ADDRESSING DUE PROCESS CONCERNS, THE LEGISLATURE AMENDED § 16-205.1(F) TO INCLUDE A REQUIREMENT THAT THE OFFICER “FULLY ADVISE” THE DRIVER OF THE ADMINISTRATIVE SANCTIONS FOR FAILING AND FOR REFUSING THE TEST.....	12
IV.  THE PRACTICE OF RAISING A <i>SITES</i> BASED DEFENSE AT MVA HEARINGS HAS BEEN FIRMLY ENTRENCHED SINCE <i>SITES</i> WAS DECIDED IN 1984, AND TRANSP. § 16-205.1 AMENDED IN 1989.....	15
V.   REQUIRING OFFICERS TO ADHERE TO <i>SITES</i> DOES NOT PREJUDICE THE MVA, BECAUSE THE RIGHT TO COUNSEL <i>BY</i> <i>DEFINITION</i> DOES NOT IMPAIR THE STATE’S ABILITY TO OBTAIN A CHEMICAL TEST.....	17

VI. THE REMEDY FOR DENIAL OF COUNSEL SHOULD BE TO TAKE NO ACTION, BECAUSE A DRIVER DENIED COUNSEL HAS NEITHER BEEN "FULLY ADVISED" OF THE ADMINISTRATIVE SANCTIONS, NOR INTELLIGENTLY AND KNOWINGLY REFUSED OR CONSENTED TO A TEST, BECAUSE IT WOULD BE FUNDAMENTALLY UNFAIR TO SUSPEND THE DRIVER'S LICENSE OF A DRIVER DENIED DUE PROCESS, AND WILL BE PERCEIVED BY THE PUBLIC AS FUNDAMENTALLY UNFAIR.....18

CONCLUSION.....21

## TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page
<i>Borbon v. Motor Vehicle Admin.</i> , 345 Md. 267, 691 A.2d 1328 (1997).....	19
<i>Brosan v. Cochran</i> , 307 Md. 662, 516 A.2d 970 (1986).....	3, 9, 17, 20
<i>DeWolfe v. Richmond</i> , 76 A.3d 1019 (Md. 2013).....	20, 21
<i>Dickerson v. United States</i> , 530 U.S. 428, 120 S. Ct. 2326, 147 L. Ed. 2d 405 (2000).....	16, 20
<i>Embrey v. Motor Vehicle Admin.</i> , 339 Md. 691, 664 A.2d 911 (1995).....	8
<i>Forman v. Motor Vehicle Admin.</i> , 332 Md. 201, 217, 630 A.2d 753, 762 (1993).....	13
<i>Friedman v. Comm'r of Pub. Safety</i> , 473 N.W.2d 828 (Minn. 1991).....	16
<i>Hall v. Sec'y of State</i> , 60 Mich. App. 431, 231 N.W.2d 396 (1975).....	16, 19
<i>Hare v. Motor Vehicle Admin.</i> , 326 Md. 296, 604 A.2d 914 (1992).....	5-6
<i>Hill v. Motor Vehicle Admin.</i> , 415 Md. 231, 999 A.2d 1019 (2010).....	8
<i>Lynn v. Magness</i> , 191 Md. 674, 62 A.2d 604 (1949).....	8
<i>McAvoy v. State</i> , 314 Md. 509, 551 A.2d 875 (1989).....	17, 20
<i>Meanor v. State</i> , 364 Md. 511, 774 A.2d 394 (2001).....	7
<i>Miranda v. Arizona</i> , 384 U.S. 436, 86 S. Ct. 1602, 16 L. Ed. 2d 694 (1966).....	16
<i>Mitchell v. United States</i> , 526 U.S. 314, 331-332, 119 S.Ct. 1307, 143 L.Ed.2d 424 (1999).....	16
<i>Moore v. State, Motor Vehicles Div. of Oregon Dep't of Transp.</i> , 293 Or. 715, 652 P.2d 794 (1982).....	16
<i>Motor Vehicle Admin. v. Atterbeary</i> , 368 Md. 480, 796 A.2d 75 (2002).....	17, 20
<i>Motor Vehicle Admin. v. Delawter</i> , 941 A.2d 1067, 403 Md. 243 (2008).....	6, 18
<i>Motor Vehicle Admin. v. Lindsay</i> , 309 Md. 557, 525 A.2d 1051 (1987).....	6
<i>Motor Vehicle Admin. v. Richards</i> , 356 Md. 356, 739 A.2d 58 (1999).....	18

